

Roadmap for
Improved university policies and procedures for faculty appointment,
retention, promotion and tenure and
Better support and stimulation to increase qualitative and
quantitative scholarly research activity
at the University of Prishtina

CONTENTS

Executive Summary 3

Introduction 5

Purpose of the study 5

Methodology5

Background 5

 Historical background 6

 Research in the legal context 6

 Support measures 7

 Current research environment 8

 Research performance 10

 Academic promotion 11

 Salaries and compensations 11

Identification of problem fields and recommendations 11

Roadmaps 20

 Development plan 21

 Procedures for faculty appointment, retention, promotion and tenure 23

 Support and stimulation measures to increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly
 research activity 23

ANNEX 1: List of information provided and/or consulted 25

ANNEX 2: List of interview partners 26

Executive Summary

Deriving recommendations for the enhancement of scholarly research activity at the University of Prishtina (UP) is a challenging task: Due to the underground teaching in the 1990`s and the war research is poorly developed, primarily because of a lack of the necessary infrastructure, equipment and an appropriate budget for research and development. Although the university officials and the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) are aware that research and development are part of the higher education system and of vital importance for the economic development in the Kosovo, the GDP is insufficient to cope with this situation. On the other hand the realistic needs have not yet been determined at university level, nor has a discussion been initiated concerning the Kosovo specific goals for the development of the research sector, generating a very complex situation requiring measures at several levels.

Therefore, recommendations for the enhancement of research activity at UP cannot be focused on measures at UP exclusively, but have to address also the (potential) role of MEST.

Purpose of the study: This consultancy was commissioned by OSCE in order to:

‘provide assistance in the provision of technical expertise to review and develop current university policies and procedures for faculty appointment, retention, promotion and tenure. Further, the consultancy is to provide concrete recommendations on how to better support, stimulate and increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly research activity.’

Methodology : The study is based on information provided by OSCE and MEST (Annex 1) and group and individual discussion meetings at MEST and the University of Prishtina (Annex 2). Further information was collected from international research databases, comparison of university policies and procedures with those in countries of the European community and recommendations of the European University Association (EUA) and others (Annex 1).

Background: The major problem research environment faces at UP is related to the parallel underground system in the 1990`s and the war time, when the nowadays academic staff was isolated from the international scientific development, and equipment was destroyed or removed. On the other hand the current economic situation does neither allow to renew the facilities within a short period nor to update to state-of-the-art level.

Furthermore, external support up to now was primarily directed towards teaching and organizational measures such as quality assurance, while research support remained low, i.e. isolated research support measures for small projects and international research stays.

Under these provisions research performance remained poor. To a large part this situation is, however, also caused by the current university policy, which is in favor of teaching by paying an additional teaching salary defrayed from tuition fees and by the current administration of the promotion system, which - although a requirement according to the statutes - neglects international standards with respect to scientific performance.

Recommendations: Based on this scenario and the apparent lack of coordination concerning external support measures in context with the development of research activity, the primary recommendation is the formulation of a development plan identifying the goals and priorities for research and teaching for future development as well as the necessary budget and the measures to achieve them, in close communication with MEST and the National Council of

Science. Second, an internal revision of the policy regarding the use of tuition fees towards an equal weighting of research is recommended, in particular towards incentives for international publications, supervision of PhD students and young researchers having gained international experience and standing. Under the current budgetary constraints not allowing the recruitment of staff on a competitive basis this approach appears to be of central importance for the development of scientific research towards European level.

In order to enhance research capacity and productivity it is further recommended to introduce measures in support of internationalization such as the establishment of partnerships with international universities by identifying proactive partners, for example former UP students working in international research institutions, the establishment of a mentoring system and joint PhD programs with international universities. In support of internationalization it is further recommended to introduce lectures and courses in English in all curricula. Such measures should find additional support by recruiting international members to the University Board and also to the National Council of Science.

Furthermore, it is recommended to set the legal provisions enabling the cooperation with the industry and other private or public partners both at the level of departments and faculties. Last it is recommended that a mode of conduct is elaborated by UP, Kosova Academy of Science and Arts (KAS) and MEST allowing real operational and organizational independence comparable to the situation found in other European countries in order to avoid conflicting situations and to support a stimulating research environment by competition for research grants at a Research Foundation, which is recommended to be implemented by MEST.

Roadmap: Since the formulation of a development plan appears to be of central importance for all aspects of this study a separate roadmap was drafted for the development plan, highlighting also the impact expected from MEST and/or the National Council of Science. The roadmaps are drafted for up to five years and foresee the implementation of measures within two years and evaluation and eventual adjustments and/or corrective measures according to the changing economic or scientific demands.

Introduction

Purpose of the study

This consultancy was commissioned by OSCE in order to:

‘provide assistance in the provision of technical expertise to review and develop current university policies and procedures for faculty appointment, retention, promotion and tenure. Further, the consultancy is to provide concrete recommendations on how to better support, stimulate and increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly research activity.’

The study therefore is focused on providing recommendations for the development of the research environment at the University of Prishtina. Since UP is a public university financed primarily by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, any recommendation will consequently also result in recommendations for necessary measures at the level of MEST in order to better support, stimulate and increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly research activity towards European level.

Methodology

The study is based on the following methodological approach:

Basic information on the organization of the University of Pristina, its statutes, the Kosovo Law on Scientific Research Activity, as well as reports on the current situation of research and development and external support measures have been provided by OSCE and MEST (see Annex 1). Based on this information group and individual discussion meetings took place at MEST and the rectorate of the University of Prishtina. Furthermore, site visits and discussion meetings at several faculties with different approaches to research (experimental, non-experimental and artistic) took place (summarized in Annex 2). In a third step the international research output of the scientific personnel (full professors, associate professors and assistant professors) was randomly checked via recognized international online databases on scientific publications, primarily google scholar, ISI Web of Knowledge, Science Direct and PubMed, which address different scientific fields at a more or less wide range.

The information obtained and collected was used to draw a picture on the current research situation relative to the promotion and research support system at the University of Prishtina. Comparison with the practice at the European level finally led to recommendations, which take into account the current economical situation of the Kosovo.

Background

The recommendations drawn are based on the following background:

- Historical development
- Legal provisions
- External support
- Current research environment
- Research performance

- Academic promotion system and
- Salaries and compensations

Historical background

The University of Prishtina was established in 1969 by the Assembly of the then Social Autonomous Province of Kosova. According to the 'Law on Establishment of the University of Prishtina' it has the status of a legal entity, which offers higher education, research, artistic work and other academic services. During the 1990`s as a consequence of the exclusion of Albanians from the university a parallel underground system of teaching in private houses existed. As a consequence there was virtually no access to research infrastructure, and isolation from the scientific development in the international scientific community.

The nowadays higher education system of the Kosovo was reestablished in full operation in 1999. Under the United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) and with the help and supervision by the Council of Europe the reform of the higher education system with the focus on the implementation of the Bologna Declaration was started, and the 'Law on Higher Education 2003/14' and the 'Law on Scientific Research Activity 2004/42' passed. It was also in 2004, when the University of Prishtina adopted the 'Statute of the University of Prishtina', which outlines the regulations and processes of the University including research as part of its tasks.

Research in the legal context

The Law on Scientific Research Activity was approved in 2004 (No. 2004/42). This law describes the basic principles of research in general, and under which provisions it is to be carried out (articles 1 -6). Article 7 points out, that "*For the purpose of fulfilling the necessary conditions and providing the means, up to 0.7% shall be allocated from the Budget of Kosova*", whereby the most prominent means to be financed are: regular scientific research activity, development and extension of scientific results, increase of the capacity and quality of scientific-research activity and publishing of science achievements.

In order to maintain development of scientific research activity in Kosova a National Council of Science has to be established (chapter 5 of the Law on Scientific Research Activity), a step which has recently been implemented by the constitutional meeting. Since the University of Prishtina at present is the only research institution in Kosova, the duties of the National Council of Science are expected to have a profound impact on the development of UP. These duties are: A) Presentation to Government of Kosova proposal of National Scientific Research Program - described in articles 51 and 52. B) Evaluation of the scientific-research activity in the meaning of its position and development at national and international level. C) Giving opinion for the need of establishing of scientific research institutes. D) Proposing and encouraging measures for advancing the scientific-research activity. E) Reviewing and giving opinion for other important issues for general development of Kosova, as requested from Kosova`s Assembly.

This law therefore sets the provisions for the development of the scientific-research activity in Kosova.

The structure of the University of Prishtina, its organs, decision finding structures and other operational measures are regulated in the Statutes of the University of Prishtina. Articles 171-175 describe the duties of the university with respect to scientific research. In particular it is

pointed out, that the university “*shall conduct scientific research and artistic work with the following objectives:*

1. *Further development of the educational process;*
2. *Introduction of students into scientific research and artistic work;*
3. *Continuing development of scientific and artistic young professionals;*
4. *Establishment of an international network of researchers and artists and*
5. *Preparation and performance of interdisciplinary oriented competitive research and arts projects.*

Other important further points are, that the university is obliged to provide appropriate conditions for scientific research and artistic work in order to enable the academic staff to achieve competitive results on the international level, that the individual performance shall be taken into account for professional assessment and career development, and that all performance data regarding scientific research and artistic work shall be stored in a central database made available by the rectorate.

Although not much space is provided for scientific research within the statute, the five articles describe a modern approach to research, taking into consideration the specific value of research within the educational process.

Support measures

Donor support has been given by several European countries as well as the United States and Canada, UNICEF, the World Bank, OSCE, the European Community via programs such as TEMPUS, ERASMUS MUNDUS, and others (summarized in the ‘Kosovo Roadmap for Improved Education Sector Performance and Aid Effectiveness’).

Donor support started with the reestablishment of the Kosovo higher education system and was directed primarily towards education (pre-primary, primary, secondary, vocational and higher education), building, reconstruction and rehabilitation for primary and secondary education, planning, management and policy making, and teacher training including the implementation of the Bologna Process.

A second sector of donor support concerns the implementation of up-to-date organizational measures, i.e. implementation of an accreditation system, quality assurance and student services. This section was in particular supported by the OSCE and the Austrian Development Agency. Recently, the TEMPUS grant ‘Fostering and Developing the Quality Culture at the University of Prishtina’ has been funded allowing the final implementation of a quality assurance and evaluation system. It can therefore be concluded that the support measures meet the requirements both at the teaching level and the level of organizational measures.

The sector ‘research’ can be considered to be under-developed, since up to now no direct support for the improvement of scientific research has been given, i.e. within the support of the Austrian Development Agency there is a limited budget for small cooperative research projects:

Besides this, some of the University teaching staff have spent time in European and US Universities carrying out research. This was achieved through the project, which WUS Austria entitles “One month research”, which means that academic staff can apply to visit Austrian Universities for a month to carry out research. Over the last two years fifty University teaching staff have made use of this opportunity.

During 2000/2001, WUS Austria through the Austrian Government financed the University's staff research work through the project "Academic Mobility Grant". This project was dedicated to supporting University staff who are working completing their Master or PhD Thesis in an Austrian University (Self-evaluation Report of the University).

Additionally, an indirect research support can be seen in projects enabling staff (WUS Austria) or students (Erasmus Mundus) to work in well-equipped research facilities, or the TEMPUS projects granted, which allow to purchase some basic equipment.

Donor support in general is focused on particular aspects and appears to follow no coordinated approach. The `Kosovo Roadmap for Improved Education Sector Performance and Aid Effectiveness` critically points out:

The overwhelming part of donor support to the Education sector takes place "off budget". Some of it is not even reported to government, but channelled to institutions and NGO's. There are a number of challenges in establishing improved coordination: development partners have sometimes overlapping and unclear inputs. Coordination is marked by its absence: no formalised structure in place for coordination; no agreement made between DPs; no single development partner is appointed as coordinator for education and DPs do not meet regularly.

Current research environment

The University of Prishtina unfortunately could not provide conclusive and detailed information on the yearly budget allocated for services (IT, library), consumables, equipment, the available research capacities and the estimated costs for renewal and modernization. According to the vice-rectorate for teaching and research the budget allocated for goods and services - supposedly including the above mentioned items - was 2.800.000,- € for 2008, according to the MEST Strategy for the Development of Higher Education in Kosova this budget was 5.058.200,- € in 2003 and 4.841.670,- € in 2004, eventually indicating a gradual decline due to redistribution of the budget.

For a university with 17 faculties, close to 2.000 employees (academic staff: approximately 1.500) and more than 31.000 students the budget for goods and services is fairly low and insufficient to cope with the deficits generated during the parallel underground education system of the 1990's and the war-time, particularly because the University of Prishtina also includes a faculty of mathematical-natural sciences, a faculty of mining and metallurgy, two technical faculties, a faculty of agriculture and a medical faculty. Such faculties require a considerable amount of consumables and equipment in order to perform basic and applied experimental research.

Visits to several departments showed the resulting deficits: lack of appropriate infrastructure, lack of adequate and modern equipment and lack of sufficient budget to afford necessary consumables.

These deficits are also expressed in the self-evaluation report of the University of Prishtina:

„The issue of institutional organized financing of scientific activity has not been discussed at the national level yet in an appropriate way. The Law on Scientific Research Activity was approved in 2004 (No. 2004/42), according to which the Government is supposed to allocate up to 0.7% of the Kosova budget for scientific research activities as specified in Article 7 of this law. But, so far there has been no budget allocation for science. It should be emphasized that the University has so far received no budget for science and research activities. The equipment that University possesses was damaged or lost during the war. Attempts were made after the war to equip the laboratories and this has been possible in some faculties

thanks to donations by the European Union, WUS Austria and the TEMPUS project, which have stimulated the research work at University. A number of TEMPUS projects have enabled some faculties to ensure a minimum infrastructure for research”.

The available budget therefore can be considered as one of the major research-performance limiting factors.

Research performance

As indicated under `Research in the legal context` all performance data regarding scientific research shall be collected as standardized statistical data and shall be stored in a central database made available by the rectorate (Statute of the University of Prishtina, article 174). Unfortunately, however, research statistics were not available. A digitalization system for data of the university is currently established by the NGO World Learning financed by USAID. Therefore, information on research performance and international visibility of research had to be derived from research databases available online. Since this approach requires searches at the individual level and is very time-consuming, academic staff members (assistant professors, associate professors and full professors) from different faculties were selected randomly and their publication record determined. The databases utilized were:

Google scholar: <http://scholar.google.de/>

This database is the largest. It covers all scientific disciplines and contains also information on publications in languages other than English as well as different types of publication formats including abstracts as part of conference symposia.

ISI Web of Knowledge: <http://www.isiwebofknowledge.com/>

Science Direct: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/>

Science Direct is a database of the Publisher Elsevier and covers physical sciences and engineering, life sciences, health sciences, social sciences and humanities.

PubMed: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/>

PubMed is a database with a focus on health sciences and the associated life sciences. The term `publication` covers a wide range, and according to the primary duties of academic staff can be subdivided into teaching materials, i.e. textbooks or the publication of original research work. In the context of this consultancy only scientific publications were taken into consideration. Scientific publications are in general ranked according to the radius of distribution: regional, national, international. Depending on the field of research publications therefore will have a more national or international focus. For example, regional history will in most instances have a regional or national focus, and the international research community will be limited. Other research fields such as physics, chemistry, life sciences, medical sciences and other experimental sciences have an international focus. Career development in these research fields requires publication at an international level. International publications can again be ranked according to the format. Original research work can be presented at international conferences, symposia or workshops with no intensive review. These publications are short summaries called abstracts and are usually published as proceedings of the conference etc. Abstracts are indicators for research work and they increase the

international visibility of a university, however, in the research fields mentioned above and many others it is generally agreed, that an international publication describes original research work, which is published in an international scientific journal after peer-review. The international reputation of a researcher depends not only on the number of publications but also on the ranking of the journal as indicated by the impact factor and the recognition in the scientific community, which is expressed by the SCI (Science Citation Index), which is the number of citations of a particular publication. The international visibility of a university therefore depends largely on these indicators, and it is one of the primary aims of a university to support its academic staff to achieve this goal and to use this ranking system for career development purposes.

When searching the databases only international publications in English as the language of the scientific community were taken into consideration. In view of the history of the University of Prishtina and the research conditions the academic staff faces the result was not surprising: At the international level the University of Prishtina is almost not present. The number of publications in peer-reviewed international journals per academic staff member is less than one, and these publications in many instances date back to the time before the crisis in Kosova. Some of the publications having appeared after the war reflect the former political situation, in particular there are for example limited `international` publications in Macedonian journals. Peer-reviewed publications in international journals after the war are very rare, however, it is recognized that the academic staff starts to become visible again at the international level, since the number of international conference abstracts is increasing. In this context the Self-evaluation Report of the University points out:

It should be mentioned that 150 researchers who have presented their research work at the international conferences and symposia in Europe and USA were supported in 2007 by the University.

Academic promotion

Academic promotion is regulated in the Statute of the University of Prishtina, articles 176 – 191. The academic staff consists of lecturers, assistant candidates, assistants, assistant professors, associated professors and full professors, and is supposed to be engaged in academic education, scientific research or artistic work. While lecturers and assistant candidates are exclusively contributing to lectures, assistants - although also contributing to teaching - are recruited from students actively enrolled in a doctoral study at the university. Therefore, assistants can be considered as the first academic staff title actively involved in research. For all other levels of academic promotion publications in an international journal are required, the demands increasing with increasing promotional level. For promotion to full professor of an academic unit the applicant must fulfill the following qualifications with respect to research:

1. *Hold a Doctorate or equivalent*
2. *Demonstrate a high level of academic competence and scientific experience in the subject, proven by:*
 - a. *A significant number of key monographs, textbooks and publications with at least five being published and reviewed in international scientific journals;*
 - b. *Active participation in international conferences;*
 - d. *Long-standing experience in basic and applied project research*

Once a person is promoted to assistant professor after application, all other steps of promotion follow more or less an automatism. After an employment period of 4 years the candidates fulfilling the requirements for the next promotional level are invited by the assessment commission for a public presentation of the results achieved in their scientific work. Interestingly, full professors are employed for a period of 4 years, however:

The acquisition of title and the duration of employment is for a period of 4 years and can be renewed for an indefinite period of time.

The statute does not give any advice on the provisions for renewal of the employment, and there is no information on external recruitment.

Salaries and compensations

Article 178 of the Statutes of the University of Prishtina determines the duties of academic staff:

The academic staff of the University shall be persons engaged in:

1. *Academic education*
2. *Scientific research*
3. *Artistic work*

The salary based on these duties is that of civil servants. In addition to the basic salary academic staff receives compensatory payments for teaching. The required budget is defrayed from tuition fees and is defined by the University Board:

Subject to the provisions of this Statute the Board shall have the following responsibilities:

4. *Defining guidelines regarding the appointment, assignment, grading, appraisal, suspension, dismissal and determination of salary and conditions of service of staff members (Article 22/6 of the Statutes of the University).*

This approach shows some deficits and leaves room for interpretation. The operative meaning of the duties could be either academic education or scientific research or artistic work, or combinations. Viewed from outside it could also be understood the way, that the duty of academic staff is either scientific research or artistic work, because teaching (academic education) receives separate recognition. Unfortunately, employment contracts are not more precise on this subject.

Identification of problem fields and recommendations

Foreword

This part of the report is supposed to address the tasks set by OSCE: “Provide assistance in the provision of technical expertise to review and develop current university policies and procedures for faculty appointment, retention, promotion and tenure. Further, the consultancy is to provide concrete recommendations on how to better support, stimulate and increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly research activity”.

An undertaken directed exclusively towards measures at the university level neglects the dependence of public universities on the government/the respective ministry, and consequently the implementation of changes at the university level will largely depend on the support measures set at the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. Therefore, every

recommendation will also directly or indirectly be addressed to MEST, which fortunately is fully aware of the problem fields (MEST Strategy for Development of Higher Education in Kosova (2005-2015)) and the role it has to play to improve the current situation. However, an establishing independent state depending on a given economic situation faces challenges at every level and due to a limited GDP has to set priorities, which will also influence the development of basic and applied research. Since it is therefore unlikely to find an immediate solution without substantial international support, the recommendations below follow a pragmatic approach.

Task one of the study is highly interrelated with and dependent on task two “recommendations on how to better support, stimulate and increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly research activity”. Task 2 will therefore be treated first.

Task `Measures to better support, stimulate and increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly research activity`

In order to carry out research at a qualitatively and quantitatively well developed level has to meet some prerequisites: appropriate infrastructure, up-to-date and appropriate equipment, an adequate budget for goods and services including access to necessary databases and literature. The University of Prishtina suffers substantially from war time. Research infrastructure, especially equipment is over-aged. Modern equipment is largely missing and it is almost impossible to introduce advanced methods, since the budget currently available for goods and services is insufficient to cope with this situation. According to the vice rector for teaching and research the budget for goods and services for 2008 is 2.800.000,- €, while the amount requested from the faculties was at least twice as much. Concerning research costs there are no major differences to European Community countries. Equipment and consumables have to be bought at the international market, allowing to compare the budget for goods and services with the budget available in other countries. For example the University of Salzburg (<http://www.uni-salzburg.at/>) comprises 4 faculties: the Faculty of Catholic Theology, the Faculty of Law, the Faculty of Cultural and Social Sciences and the Faculty of Natural Sciences, the latter being an experimentally oriented faculty comparable to the faculty of mathematical-natural sciences of the University of Prishtina. The number of students at the University of Salzburg is approximately 11.000, the number of academic staff members is approximately 550. In 2007 the expenses for goods and services were (source: Handbook of the University):

- Equipment: 1.100.000,- €
- Appointments (equipment, facilities, etc.): 1.200.000,- €
- Literature: 2.760.000,- €
- IT-services: 3.500.000,- €
- Costs for infrastructure (maintenance, rents, running costs): 14.000.000,- €

Although no direct comparison with the University of Prishtina is possible (UP comprises 17 faculties, 6 of which can be considered to be focused on experimental research including the medical faculty), this example clearly indicates the financial drawbacks for research apart from the additional drawback, that research infrastructure has to be almost completely renewed and updated.

External support up to now was mainly directed towards improvement of teaching at the qualitative level and towards the introduction and implementation of up-to-date organizational

procedures, while the research sector largely remained untouched, although it is generally agreed, that teaching and research are linked in higher education (Recommendation No. R (2000) 8 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the research mission of universities, and EUA Statement on the Bologna Process Bergen Ministerial meeting 19 – 20 May 2005). This holds true for master theses and in particular for PhD programs. The question therefore arises whether research has not yet been recognized as part of the mission of the university or whether support was accepted as offered, irrespective of the most urgent needs. From the titles of the support measures the latter appears to be the case, indicating a lack of coordination, which was also attested in the `Kosovo Roadmap for Improved Education Sector Performance and Aid Effectiveness`.

Therefore, the first recommendation is the formulation of a **Development Plan for the University of Prishtina** with:

1. a clear definition of its mission in accordance to the respective laws and public demands
2. a precise description of the current state: budget, infrastructure, facilities, output
3. a clear definition of the goals and priorities in teaching and research to be achieved within a realistic time frame, i.e. 5 years
4. a precise description of the measures required for the achievement including the necessary budget
5. a clear definition of achievement indicators
6. a description of the procedures for progress monitoring, evaluation and corrective measures

This development plan thus is supposed to be a strategic plan which, once agreed upon, should allow to target external support measures in an efficient and economic way. Furthermore, it is supposed to represent a stringent argumentation line for measures to be set by the MEST or even the European Community.

Recommendations for measures at **Ministry of Education, Science and Technology** to support the enhancement of research activities:

The University of Pristina is a public university financed by the government/MEST. Measures for the improvement of research at UP therefore also involve the contribution of MEST. According to the Law on Scientific Research Activity the **National Council of Science** is responsible for the development of scientific research activity of Kosova (article 53). With respect to the study it:

- (a) *presents to government of Kosova proposal of National Scientific-Research Program;*
- (b) *evaluates, in the meaning of comparing, situation in scientific research activity, its position and development in national and international level;*
- (c) *gives opinion for the need of establishing of scientific-research institutes;*
- (d) *proposes and encourages measures for advancing the scientific-research activity*

The National Council for Research therefore is a powerful organ, which can significantly influence the development of research at the University of Prishtina. Recently the National Council of Science was constituted. Its members were proposed according to the Law on Scientific Research Activity, article 56, and are mainly recruited from the university. Although it is not explicitly prohibited, no external/international members were proposed. International members, however, in particular those, who are engaged in research internationally, could contribute to the development of the Kosovo research environment by adding an external view and by helping to raise support. It is therefore suggested, that the Law on Scientific Research Activity, article 56, should be discussed in view of a specification with respect to a minimum **requirement of international members**. As an ad hoc measure it is recommended to recruit external/international members as advisors to the Council.

As elaborated above the major drawback for the enhancement of research activities is the available budget. Additionally, the fraction of tuition fees dedicated to research at UP is very low and currently amounts to virtually zero due to the lowering of the tuition fees. To improve scientific research at UP it is therefore absolutely essential for the motivated academic staff members to have a national institution, where they can apply for research money.

According to the Law on Scientific Research Activity, article 54, the National Council of Science presents to the Government of Kosovo a proposal of National Scientific-Research Program, article 51, which has to contain the necessary means for fulfillment of National Scientific Program (article 51 i). One of the standard means at the European level is a **National Science Foundation**, which would allow on a competitive basis (international peer-review) to apply for funding of research projects.

Whether such an institution can be implemented at present depends largely on the GDP and the priorities set by the government/MEST. Nevertheless, in view of the necessity (in terms of the economic benefit) to improve research in Kosovo, it should be given high priority.

Recommendations for **research incentives** as measures to enhance research activity:

Apart from the deficits with respect to the provision of appropriate research conditions, the current administrative approach concerning the use of tuition fees generates a situation in favor of teaching and almost completely neglects the research sector leading to the situation that teaching is much more attractive financially than research.

Currently the university charges a fee of 50,- € per student and semester. These fees are spent according to university regulations for repair and infrastructure, academic staff, scholarships, research and social measures. Owing to the necessity to improve infrastructure a large part of the fees is dedicated to this purpose. The second largest, around 30% is dedicated for academic staff and represents a payment for teaching in addition to the basic salary. For full professors the teaching duty is 5 hours a week, and amounts to 250,- €. If necessary, additional teaching is possible - up to 6 hours per week for full professors and 20 hours per week for assistants.

In order to support research activity it is therefore recommended to lower the teaching budget and to allocate a certain amount of the student fees to research. Incentives could be envisaged at three levels:

International publications: For example, the first author of an original publication in an international peer-reviewed journal could receive an individual monetary benefit, either on a basis comparable to teaching benefits or as a single payment. In this case the academic staff can decide, whether he/she should focus more on research or teaching. Such a regulation would be in line with the `MEST Strategy for Development of Higher Education in Kosova (2005-2015)` and could therefore be readily implemented:

4.2. Special incentives are planned for scholars who publish their work in magazines with international reviews or in other publications with competent editing and with international reputation.

PhD programs: Several faculties at the University of Pristina already introduced a PhD program. A doctoral thesis is generally understood as the conduct of scientific research under the supervision of qualified academic staff (associate or full professors). Research work is therefore carried out in a particular department or institute, the resources of which are used. Therefore, this organizational unit should be compensated for in a performance oriented approach. Since there is generally no other unit involved, it is recommended that the student fees in this case should fully be allocated to that unit. The same applies for master students working on the master thesis, where a similar situation of supervision is given.

International mobility: Currently the university continues to pay the salary for academic staff members for one year, when they do research work at an international research institution. This approach is a good starting point to motivate academic staff to improve their research skills and to publish the obtained results. Nevertheless, the motivated researcher has to find additional international support in order to cover the expenses in the guest institution, and once returned to the home institution will face the research environment described above, which makes the effort again less attractive, particularly under the current promotion system. Therefore it is recommended, that the university should give substantial support to continue research work at a level close to the one experienced in the guest institution, i.e. support for necessary and appropriate equipment and consumables. Under these premises both teaching and research at UP will benefit.

In case international research stays serve as tools for the achievement of the goals of the development plan, they should be described in detail relative to the specific goals in teaching and research.

Recommendations for **Internationalisation measures** in support of research activities

One of the conclusions of the EUA Conference “Research Training as a Key to a Europe of Knowledge” Maastricht (2004) reads:

Research/ doctoral training needs internationalisation: more mobility, more joint programmes, bilateral or international cooperation and researchdriven networks is the only way towards ambitious goals of becoming the most competitive knowledge based continent. Universities have to build/provide institutional support structures and mechanisms for mobility (e.g.academic staff mobility offices).

This recommendation of the EUA perfectly meets the requirements of the University of Prishtina to establish an international research culture under the current financial constraints, since joint programs and bilateral as well as international cooperations allow to acquire modern technical skills, a more immediate access to the international scientific community, foreign language skills and experience with presentation and publishing of research findings.

It is therefore recommended

- to **establish joint PhD programs** with European and other international universities: Such programs offer the advantage of a solid basic education at UP combined with the realization of the doctoral thesis in internationally recognized and well equipped

institutions. Students in this case should have supervisors at both universities in order to obtain a better identification with the research work and the cooperation itself.

- to **establish partnerships** with universities in Europe and abroad: Partnerships are formal cooperation agreements concerning both higher education and research cooperation. Since partnerships will have to be supported financially by the respective host institution, academic staff or students, in particular PhD students, will more readily accept exchange calls.
- to **establish a mentoring system for PhD students**: Depending on the field of study mentors can be found both in international universities/research institutions and in enterprises. Mentors in this case are understood as persons providing financial support for individual PhD students allowing them to carry out doctoral research work at the highest level.
- to **establish of a database and contacts to former UP students** successful as researchers abroad or in leading position in national and international companies: The purpose of such a database is to involve Kosovars in the development of scientific research at UP, both as partners for international cooperation, mentors and supporters in general. Furthermore, positive contacts could particularly be useful for applications within the framework programs of the European Community.

University Board: As pointed out above focused measures have to be taken to improve the research situation by intensifying international cooperation. In support of internationalization an added value for UP is expected to be obtained also by the integration of international members into the decision making process. This holds particularly true for the university board, which is composed of 5 members nominated by the senate of the university and 4 members nominated by the ministry. At present, all members nominated are from the Kosovo, and there is a dominance of the university members. This situation is in favor of the university, and is documented also by the fact, that the chair of the board is elected from the members nominated by the university. Such an arrangement supports the traditional organization and work flow of the university. International members on the other hand could contribute to the development of the university by adding an external view, and could be helpful by raising private support for the university, as already pointed out when discussing a similar situation within the National Council of Science.

Since there is no regulation prohibiting the nomination of international members, it is recommended that UP revises its statutes towards a minimum requirement of international members both for the members elected by the university and by the ministry. Since the mandate of the members of the board is assigned for 3 years, an ad hoc measure would be the recruitment of external/international members as advisors to the Board.

Internationalization as drafted above requires master and PhD students to gain sufficient language skills, in particular English as the primary language of the European research area and the language of international research. In this respect, different faculties have already developed separate approaches. While the more experimentally oriented faculties require better knowledge in English due to the English research literature, others do not face these motivating conditions. For example, the faculty of agriculture demands a defense of the doctoral thesis in English. In order to support internationalization and competitiveness at the European level it is therefore recommended that **lectures and courses held in English** are offered in all curricula, and that preparatory courses in English are offered by the faculty of

philology. These courses should also be accessible for academic staff members, who want to improve their knowledge of English.

Cooperation with private enterprises and public bodies:

During the discussions at the faculties it became evident, that cooperation with private enterprises is not possible at the faculty or department level, since these organizational units do not have the right to sign contracts. Such a regulation appears to be counterproductive, since it inhibits the efforts of motivated personnel to acquire the budget necessary for buying research material and equipment, and eventually to recruit personnel for carrying out this kind of applied research and/or development work. Carrying out applied research for external partners gives these units and the university in general a good standing within the society. Therefore, such cooperation is desirable. On the other hand it is understandable that the university management has to know, which cooperation is ongoing, for what time and under which conditions, since any cooperation will result in the use of infrastructure, for which it is responsible.

Every European university deals with this situation in a different way. The simplest approach is to notify the management of the university about the cooperation project and the terms of conduct, and the management decides about the refund for the use of infrastructure etc. and then gives permission to carry out the project. It is therefore recommended that the university provides regulations within its statute in order to allow such cooperation.

In this context it is particularly helpful to compare with the opinion at the European level. For example, the EUA Conference “Research Training as a Key to a Europe of Knowledge” in Maastricht (2004) recommends:

University-industry cooperation has to be strengthened and built on mutual trust and openness, while realizing the uniqueness and core mission of each party.

Furthermore, the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology in its ‘Strategy Development of Higher Education in Kosova (2004)’ lists under 3.2, that funds for scientific research will be made available among others from ‘*cooperation with economy*’, indicating that MEST recognizes the value of cooperation between the university and private companies. MEST therefore should also set the necessary legal provisions to enable such cooperation.

Competitive environment

Currently the only research institution in the Kosovo is the University of Prishtina. Competition for resources takes place at the university, not between universities or the university and other scientific research institutions. The only research institution apart from UP is the Academy of Sciences and Arts. Up to now it can be considered to be a virtual institution, personally and spatially co-localizing with the university, a situation, which may lead to tensions within the university due to the mandate of the Academy and its separate budget. According to the Law on the Academy of Science and Arts in the Kosovo, the Kosovo Academy of Science and Arts (KAS) should be the supreme institution of science and arts in Kosovo, and should be independent. Independence can be understood as a configuration, which avoids conflicts of interest, i.e. the president of the National Council of Science is the president of the Kosova Academy of Science and Arts and also a member of the University of Prishtina. Such a set-up may provoke especially conflicts with the University Board and the university management due to the mission of the Academy being a consultative institution for development of science and arts, and of reviewing general problems in the areas of scientific activity and artistic creativity.

To avoid any conflicts, which may negatively influence scientific research activity at UP it is therefore recommended that a mode of conduct is elaborated by UP, KAS and MEST allowing real operational and organizational independence comparable to the situation found in other European countries, where universities and academies are separate institutions with separate personnel. These conditions would additionally allow competition for research money depending on the quality of the research work and the performance of the scientists, further provoking efforts towards higher productivity.

Independent of competition between research institutions the value of scientific research could be enhanced by an internal competition concerning the budget of the faculties and departments by defining a fraction of the budget, which is allocated based on indicators for performance in scientific research. Examples for such an approach are found in many European universities.

Task `Provide assistance in the provision of technical expertise to review and develop current university policies and procedures for faculty appointment, retention, promotion and tenure`

Under the assumption that the ultimate goal of the University of Prishtina is the development towards European Community level, it will have to meet the recommendations set by the Council of Europe (Recommendation No. R (2000) 8 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the research mission of universities):

5.10. Governments and universities should be encouraged to base the recruitment and career advancement of teachers on competition and good performance in both teaching and research. Permanent posts in teaching and research should be advertised publicly. For these posts no nationality requirement should exist. A strategic aim of recruitment policy should be to identify and recruit candidates from outside as well inside the university.

This statement clearly points out there are two potential ways of recruitment: internal promotion and external recruitment. The strategies differ from country to country. While Germany prohibits internal promotion in order to avoid `scientific inbreeding` due to the formation of so-called scientific schools, other countries are more flexible considering persons, who spent part of their scientific career in international institutions and later returned to their original home institution, as external applicants. At the University of Prishtina on the contrary a system emerged, which is founded solely on internal promotion. Unfortunately the economic situation is still in favor of the current promotion system, and UP cannot afford to recruit professors from outside, i.e. the European research area, on a competitive basis. Nevertheless, even under the current conditions good performance in research can be supported by different measures:

Teaching duties: According to the statutes of the University of Prishtina there are the following career steps: assistant candidate, assistant, assistant professor, associate professor and full professor. While the first two types of employment are primarily dedicated to teaching, the latter can be understood as researchers, because of the requirements for promotion: holding a doctorate and having published in scientific journals – at least one key publication in an international reviewed journal. Nevertheless, the research oriented promotion system of UP as described above indirectly starts with the position of an assistant. Assistants are employed primarily for teaching duties but have to be students working on a doctoral thesis (scientific research).

Research at universities world-wide is primarily carried out by PhD students and young research personnel, in other words by assistants and assistant professors, while the established full professors are generally more engaged with teaching. Therefore, the younger researchers have lower teaching duties. For example in Austria there is a gradual increase of teaching duties from 2 (research employees, who are working on their doctoral thesis) via 4 (assistant professors) and 6 (associate professors) to 8 hours (full professors) per semester. This allows the younger ones to concentrate on research and to develop their own research focus and research profile, and eventually gain a good standing in the international scientific community. At the University of Prishtina the upper teaching limit for assistants is 20 hours per week, while that of full professors is 6 hours per week. Since preparation times have to be included into teaching duties, it is almost impossible to do research under these conditions and to finish PhD work within the employment time of 3 years. Provided the best students were selected for an assistant position, they will most likely not meet the requirements for further promotion to assistant professor (productive researcher publishing in peer-reviewed international journals), the eventual consequence being the loss of the best. Therefore it is recommended to revise these regulations in favor of research: Young and motivated research personnel should have sufficient time and support to develop an own research profile.

Further promotional steps: An assistant professor is employed for a period of 4 years and can then apply for associate professorship, which can be granted, once the criteria outlined are met. Again this employment will have duration of 4 years. Thereafter, the associate professor can apply for full professorship, the duration of which is again 4 years and can be renewed without any performance control for an indefinite period.

Such a promotion scheme generates an automatism in favor of the employment of people already working at UP, since renewal by recruiting researchers from outside with new scientific approaches, skills, methods and experience is almost impossible at a competitive basis. As a consequence, renewal of the research capacities is recommended to be reinforced by measures for **training at the highest level of young researchers**, i.e. doctoral students and assistants, via international cooperation and joint PhD programs.

The recent elevation of the retirement age to 70 years poses an additional problem for renewal of the research capacities. This measure should therefore also be reassessed.

International publications:

Promotion to full professor according to the statutes of the University of Prishtina requires `A significant number of key monographs, textbooks and publications with at least five being published and reviewed in international scientific journals.` The good part of this regulation is the recognition of scientific publications as a requirement for professorship. When comparing the publication record of academic staff on a random sample basis (as elaborated above) by consulting international research databases it becomes evident, however, that the understanding of an international publication at UP differs largely from that at universities in the European Community. Academic staff members (assistant to full professors) usually have a publication record of less than one original research paper published in peer-reviewed international journals. Although this low output is understandable from the contemporary history of the university, all necessary measures should be taken to reinforce publication at the highest level, and the current promotion system should be revised in demand of this quality level.

In order to enhance research activity at a qualitative and quantitative level it is therefore recommended, that the current promotion system for academic staff is revised towards:

- a. enabling young academic staff, in particular assistants, to find sufficient support to concentrate on their research work;
- b. enabling young academic staff to obtain experience, skills and standing at the international level;
- c. a demand for original publications in peer-reviewed international journals and other internationally visible research-related activities such as review activities for ranked international journals, operational duties in international scientific societies, etc.;
- d. an open system of application for academic positions, in particular assistant, associate and full professors, by public advertisement, which is not restricted to the Kosovo.

Furthermore, the commitment of the university to research should find recognition in the job descriptions and employment contracts. Since every position will meet different requirements in teaching and research, the duties may vary from contract to contract.

For comparison see ` Recommendation No. R (2000) 8 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the research mission of universities`:

4. The link between teaching and research

4.1. In designing their higher education systems, governments should aim at creating conditions for universities where teaching and research are equally integrated into their organization and structure.

4.2. The exact balance of research and teaching may vary according to the type of institution and between individuals within the same institution. Governments should ensure that permanent academic staff have duties in both teaching and research.

4.3. Universities should be encouraged to organize teaching and research in a diversified way, so as to allow the time spent by academics on each of them to vary. Academic staff members should be able to concentrate on research for a certain period, without unduly reducing the provision of study courses in the given field.

Roadmaps

The major challenge of drafting a roadmap for the enhancement of research activity is the current lack of coordination of support activities together with the lack of an appropriate budget to set substantial measures. For example, digitalization of the university is ongoing and financed by USAID. Quality assurance and evaluation will soon be put forward by a TEMPUS grant. Evaluation requires information, which should be made available from an electronic database, and the most economic approach is to use the one which is generated by the above support measure. In terms of research activity it would even be more economic to

transfer an electronic database, available at most European universities, free of charge to the University of Prishtina - not everything has to be developed from the scratch!

This example shows that all measures have to be coordinated and that coordination requires clear goals and a generally agreed strategy. Therefore the major milestone towards an enhanced research activity is a binding development plan.

1. Development plan:

Short-term measures: 1 year

University of Prishtina	Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and/or National Council of Science
<p>Description of the current state: facilities, infrastructure, equipment, budget, output</p> <p>Realistic estimation of the resources necessary to proceed towards European level in teaching and research</p> <p>Definition of priority fields in higher education and research based on the strengths and weaknesses of UP, and the fields to be established in close communication with the faculties, departments and the MEST</p> <p>Agreement on the future dedication of the professorships of the professors retiring within the time frame of the development plan</p> <p>Determination of evaluation criteria (performance indicators) in context with the implementation of a quality assurance system (TEMPUS)</p> <p>Description of the measures required for the achievement including the required budget.</p> <p>Determination of and agreement on achievement indicators</p> <p>Agreement on procedures for progress monitoring, evaluation and corrective measures</p> <p>Communication and discussion of the draft development plan with the MEST</p> <p>Adaptation of the development plan according</p>	<p>Definition of priority fields in higher education and research on demands for development of society and economy.</p> <p>Communication to UP</p> <p>Discussion of the draft development plan with respect to the mission of UP and the required resources</p> <p>Approval of the development plan</p>

to the feedback of MEST	
Approval of the development plan	

Medium-term measures: 2 years

University of Prishtina	Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and/or National Council of Science
<p>Implementation of the development plan</p> <p>Revision and adjustment of the Statutes of the University of Prishtina according to the demands of the development plan</p>	<p>Discussion and allocation of the budget necessary to implement the development plan</p> <p>Setting of measures for international (European Community) support based on the requirements as documented in the development plan</p> <p>Eventual adjustment (precision) of the Law on Scientific Research Activity in support of the implementation of the development plan (i.e. cooperation with the industry, national science foundation, external/international members of the National Council of Science, university organizational law, etc)</p>

Long-term measures: 5 years

University of Prishtina	Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and/or National Council of Science
<p>Adjustment of the development plan according to the results obtained by the faculty evaluations (TEMPUS)</p> <p>Internal mid-term evaluation of the development plan and eventual setting of adjustments/corrective measures according to the changing economic or scientific demands</p>	<p>Approval of the adjustments to the development plan</p>

2. Procedures for faculty appointment, retention, promotion and tenure

Short-term: 1 year	Medium-term: 2 years	Long-term: 5 years
<p>Initiation of the decision-making process at UP towards:</p> <p>a) Determination of the relative importance of research for higher education at UP</p> <p>b) Reevaluation of the current procedures for faculty appointment towards a model of both internal and external recruitment on a competitive basis</p> <p>c) Definition of the minimum requirements in teaching and research for the appointment or promotion, and the tenure of academic staff</p> <p>d) The quality level of international publications to be achieved for appointment of academic staff</p> <p>Adjustment of the Statutes of UP according to the decisions made</p> <p>Approval of the changes to the statutes by MEST/government</p>	<p>Preparation of a template for employment contracts including the duties in teaching and research</p> <p>Adoption of a public advertisement system for academic staff</p> <p>Implementation of the academic recruitment and promotion system</p> <p>Advertisement and recruitment of new academic staff according to the dedication set in the development plan</p>	<p>Evaluation of the recruitment system and eventual adjustment/improvement according to the changing economic or scientific demands</p>

3. Support and stimulation measures to increase qualitative and quantitative scholarly research activity

Short-term: 1 year	Medium-term: 2 years	Long-term: 5 years
<p>Initiation of the decision-making process at UP towards support of qualified young academic staff (assistants, assistant professors) to concentrate on research work (basic or applied) by:</p> <p>a) Providing the best possible research environment at UP</p> <p>b) Limiting the work load for teaching (i.e. an upper limit of 4 hours per week)</p> <p>c) Enabling at least a one year research stay in an international research institution</p> <p>Use of tuition fees:</p> <p>a) Revision of the current policy of payments for teaching towards</p>	<p>Decision on and implementation of the support measures for young qualified academic staff</p> <p>Communication with MEST, and request for development support, i.e. stipends</p> <p>Selection of the candidates based on the development plan on a competitive basis</p> <p>Provision of the necessary support</p>	<p>Evaluation of the effectiveness of the support measures for qualified young academic staff and eventual adjustment/improvement according to the changing economic or scientific demands</p> <p>Evaluation of the effectiveness of</p>

ANNEX 1: List of information provided or consulted

1. Law on Scientific Research Activity (No. 2004/42)
2. UNMIK REGULATION NO. 2003/14: On the promulgation of a law adopted by the assembly of Kosovo on higher education in Kosovo
3. Statute of the University, 2004
4. MEST Strategy for Development of Higher Education in Kosova (2005-2015), 2004
5. Armend Tahirsylaj (2004) Higher Education in Kosovo: Major changes, Reforms and Development Trends in Post-conflict period at University of Prishtina
6. Kosovo National Report 2005: Towards the European higher education area – Bologna Process
7. Kosovo Roadmap for Improved Education Sector Performance and Aid Effectiveness, SIPU International – Swedish Institute for Public Administration, 2008
8. University of Prishtina Self-assessment Report, 2008
9. University statistics 2008: power point presentation `shtojca 4`
10. Steering Platform on Research for the Western Balkan Countries, Thematic Report: Science and Technology in Kosovo/UNMIK, 2008
11. EUA Conference “Research Training as a Key to a Europe of Knowledge” Maastricht, 28 – 30 October 2004. Summary of conclusions and recommendations of the Plenary sessions and Discussion groups.
12. Recommendation No. R (2000) 8 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the research mission of universities
13. EUA Statement on the Bologna Process Bergen Ministerial meeting 19 – 20 May 2005

Databases:

14. <http://scholar.google.de/>
15. <http://www.isiwebofknowledge.com/>
16. <http://www.sciencedirect.com/>
17. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/>

ANNEX 2: List of interview partners

1. Enver Hoxhaj, Minister of Science Education and Technology, Government of Kosova, Prishtina
2. Fetah Podvorica, Political Advisor to the Prime Minister – Education and Science Issues, Government of Kosova, Prishtina
3. Avdulla Alija, Director of Higher Education Department, Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, Prishtina
4. Murteza Osdautaj, Director of the Department of Science and Technology, MEST, Prishtina
5. Blerim Canaj, Head of the International Cooperation Center on the Higher Education, Science and Technology, MEST, Prishtina
6. Luan Ahma, Vice Rector for Teaching and Research, University of Prishtina
7. Marjan Dema, Vice Rector for Resources and Infrastructure, University of Prishtina
8. Myzafere Limani, Dean, Faculty of Electrical and Computer Engineering
9. Ahmet Derguti, Dean, Faculty of Arts, University of Prishtina
10. Ferit Kocani, Vice Dean, Medical Faculty, University of Prishtina
11. Osman Gashi, Vice Dean, Faculty of Philology, University of Prishtina
12. Shukri Fetahu, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Prishtina
13. Rrustem Asllanaj, Dean, Faculty of Economics, University of Prishtina

Further informations were provided by:

Francesco Bigagli, Chief, Higher Education Section, Department for Assistance, OSCE Mission in Kosovo

Blerim Saqipi, National Programme Officer, Department of Assistance, Higher Education Section, OSCE Mission in Kosovo